

## CAN YOU ANSWER THESE QUESTIONS?

1. Contrast the traditional view of Talmud study with that of the Haskalah.
2. Describe the educational program endorsed by Naftali Tzvi (Hartwig) Wessely in his *Divrei Shalom V'Emess*.
3. Why was the nineteenth century Russian government such a proponent for the modernization of Russian Jewry?
4. According to Moses Hess, what was the cause of anti-Semitism?
5. How did this explanation differ from that of Dr. Leon Pinsker?

This and much more will be addressed in the seventh lecture of this series:

**"The Secular Enlightenment  
and the Modernization of Eastern European Jewry".**

To derive maximum benefit from this lecture, keep these questions in mind as you listen to the lecture and read through the outline. Go back to these questions once again at the end of the lecture and see how well you answer them.

PLEASE NOTE: This outline and source book were designed as a powerful tool to help you appreciate and understand the basis of Jewish History. Although the lectures can be listened to without the use of the outline, we advise you to read the outline to enhance your comprehension. Use it, as well, as a handy reference guide and for quick review.

**This lecture is dedicated to the memory and *Li-ilui Nishmos***

שאול בן שמואל ולאה בת נתן ע"ה

**Mr. and Mrs. Saul and Lorraine Reubin of blessed memory.**

THE EPIC OF THE ETERNAL PEOPLE  
Presented by Rabbi Shmuel Irons

Series XXI Lecture #7

THE SECULAR ENLIGHTENMENT  
AND THE MODERNIZATION OF EASTERN EUROPEAN JEWRY

I. Torah and the Secret of Jewish Continuity

A.

אמר רבי נתן אין לך אהבה כאהבת התורה. אבות דרבי נתן כה:א

Rabbi Nasan said: There is no love like the love of Torah. **Avos D'Rabbi Nasan 28:1**

B.

אֲשֶׁרִי הָאִישׁ אֲשֶׁר לֹא הִלֵּךְ בְּעֵצַת רְשָׁעִים וּבְדַרְךְ חַטָּאִים לֹא עָמַד וּבְמוֹשֵׁב לְצִים לֹא יָשָׁב: כִּי אִם בְּתוֹרַת ד' חָפְצוֹ וּבְתוֹרַתוֹ יִהְיֶה יוֹמָם וְלַיְלָה תְהִלִּים פֶּרֶק א:א/ב

Fortunate is the man who does not walk in the counsel of the wicked, nor stands in the way of the sinners, nor sits in the seat of the scornful. But his **delight** is in the Torah of the L-rd and in His Torah does he meditate day and night. **Psalms 1:1,2**

C. Our principle care of all is this: to educate our children well, and we think it to be the most necessary business of our whole life to observe the laws that have been given us and to keep those rules of piety that have been delivered down to us. **Josephus, Against Apion Book I Par. 12**

D. But for our people, if anybody but asks any one of them about our laws, he will more readily tell him all than he will tell his own name and this is in consequence of our having learned them as soon as we became sensible of any thing and of our having them, as it were, engraved on our souls. **Josephus, Against Apion Book II Par. 19**

E.

מתוך קנאת ד' ואהבת תורה הם שולחים את כל בניהם ללמוד כדי שיבינו בתורת ד'. היהודי, גם העני שבעניים אם יש לו עשרה בנים ישלח אותם ללמוד. . . . ולא רק את הבנים אלא אף את הבנות. מתוך דברי תיאולוג נוצרי, תלמידו של אבאלארדוס. סוף המאה הי"ב למספרם

As a result of a G-dly passion and a love of Torah do [the Jews] send their children to study in order that they know G-d's Torah. Even the poorest of the Jewish poor, who has ten sons, will send them all away to study Torah. . . . And not just the sons, but also the daughters [are educated in Torah]. **The words of a twelfth century Christian theologian who was a disciple of Peter Abelard**

F.

יושב ומלמד כל היום וקצת מהלילה, כדי לחנכם ללמוד ביום ובלילה. שולחן ערוך יורה דעה סימן רמה סעיף יא

The teacher should sit and teach them the entire day and part of the night, in order to train them to study day and night. **Shulchan Aruch Yoreh Deah 245:11**

G.

לא יבטלו התינוקות כלל, חוץ מערב שבת וערב יום טוב בסוף היום. שולחן ערוך יורה דעה סימן רמה סעיף יב

With the exception of late Friday afternoon and the late afternoon of *Erev Yom Tov* (the day before a holiday), school children should not be released from their studies. **Shulchan Aruch Yoreh Deah 245:12**

## II. The Centrality of the Study of the Talmud

A.

גלות המר והארוך [היא שדחקה אותם] שלא היה בידם יכלת ללמד את בניהם את כל החכמות על כן ראו אבותינו הקדושים ובפרט חסידי אשכנז למשוך את בניהם אחר התלמוד בלבד ולהרגילים ולחנכם אחר הספר הקדוש הזה כי בו חכמה ויראת ד' במקום אחד והוא הלחם והמזון האמתי אשר בצלו נחיה בגויים. ס' עץ חיים מר' חיים בר' בצלאל אחי המהר"ל מפראג

This bitter and long *golus* (exile) is what forced them, for they were unable to teach their children all the areas of wisdom. Therefore, our holy forefathers saw, especially the Chasidei Ashkenaz, to only attract their children to the study of the Talmud and to accustom them and initiate them to this holy work. For, in it lies wisdom and the fear of G-d, all in one place. It is the true bread and sustenance and affords us the protection to live amongst the Gentiles. **Sefer Aitz Chaim, authored by R. Chaim b. R. Betzalel, the brother of the Maharal of Prague**

B.

וְאִם-לֹא תִשְׁמְעוּ לִי וְלֹא תַעֲשׂוּ אֶת כָּל-הַמִּצְוֹת הָאֵלֶּה: וְאִם-בְּחַקְתִּי תִמְאַסּוּ וְאִם אֶת-מִשְׁפָּטֵי תִגְעַל נַפְשְׁכֶם לְבַלְתִּי עֲשׂוֹת אֶת-כָּל-מִצְוֹתַי לְהַפְרֹכֶם אֶת-בְּרִיתִי: . . . וְאִבְדַּתֶּם בְּגוֹיִם וְאָכַלְהָ אֶתְכֶם אֶרֶץ אִי־בִיכֶם: וְהִנְשָׂאִים בְּכֶם יִמְקוּ בְּעוֹנֵם בְּאֶרֶץ אִי־בִיכֶם וְאִף בְּעוֹנֵת אֲבֹתֶם אֶתֶם יִמְקוּ:

But if you will not listen to Me, and will not do all these commandments; And if you shall despise My statutes, or if your soul loathes My judgments, so that you will not do all My commandments, but that you break My covenant; . . . And you shall perish among the nations, and the land of your enemies shall eat you up. And those who are left of you shall pine away in their iniquity in your enemies' lands; and also in the iniquities of their fathers shall they pine away with them. . . . **Leviticus 26:14-15, 38-39**

C.

(יד) וְאִם לֹא תִשְׁמְעוּ לִי. להיות עמלים בתורה, ולדעת מדרש חכמים. יכול לקיום המצות, כשהוא אומר ולא תעשו וגו' הרי קיום מצות אמור, הא מה אני מקיים ואם לא תשמעו לי, להיות עמלים בתורה. ומה תלמוד לומר לי, אין לי אלא זה המכיר את רבונו ומתכוין למרוד בו, וכך בנמרוד גבור ציד לפני ד' (בראשית י:ט), שמכירו ומתכוין למרוד בו, וכך באנשי סדום רעים וחטאים לד' מאד (שם יג:יג), מכירים את רבונו ומתכוונים למרוד בו: ולא תעשו. משלא תלמדו, לא תעשו, הרי שתי עבירות (ת"כ פרשתא ב, ג.): (טו) וְאִם בְּחַקְתִּי תִמְאַסּוּ. מואס באחרים העושים: משפטי תגעל נפשכם. שונא החכמים: לבלתי עשות. מונע את אחרים מעשות: את כל מצותי. כופר שלא צויתים, לכך נאמר את כל מצותי, ולא נאמר את כל המצות: להפרכם את בריתי. כופר בעיקר. הרי שבע עבירות, הראשונה גוררת השניה, וכך עד השביעית, ואלו הן, לא למד, ולא עשה, מואס באחרים העושים, שונא את החכמים, מונע את האחרים, כופר במצות, כופר בעיקר: רש"י שם

**But if you will not listen to Me:** to toil in the study of Torah and **to know the interpretations of the Sages.** I might think that this refers to the fulfillment of the commandments; but since it

states, “and will not do all these commandments,” then the commandments are already stated. What then is implied by the expression, “But if you will not listen to me”? That you should toil in the study of Torah. And what is implied by the phrase, “to Me”? “To Me,” refers specifically to one who acknowledges his Master and yet intends to rebel against Him. Similarly, in the case of Nimrod, [who is described as (Gen. 10:9), “A mighty warrior before the L-rd,”] it is referring to the fact that he acknowledged Him and nevertheless intended to rebel against Him. Similarly, in the case of the people of Sodom who are described as being (Genesis 13:13), “Wicked and sinners against the L-rd exceedingly,” i.e. they acknowledged their Master and nevertheless they intended to rebel against Him. (Sifra) **And will not do all these commandments;** Since you will not learn, you will not do. Thus there are two transgressions. (Sifra) **And if you shall despise My statutes,** i.e. he despised others who do the commandments. **or if your soul loathes My judgments,** i.e. he loathes the Sages. **so that you will not do** i.e. he prevents others from observing them. **all My commandments,** He denies that I commanded them; for that reason it is stated, “all My commandments,” rather than, “all the commandments.” **but that you break My covenant;** He denies the most fundamental principle, i.e. the existence of G-d. Thus there are seven transgressions; the first brings to the second and so on until the seventh. And this is the list: **1)** He does not study [the teachings of the Sages,] **2)** he does not fulfill the commandments, **3)** he despises others that do, **4)** he loathes the Sages **5)** he prevents others from observing them **6)** he denies the Divine origin of the commandments and **7)** he denies the most fundamental principle, i.e. the existence of G-d. **Rashi to Leviticus 26:14-15**

D.

רש"י ד"ה מהגיון. לא תרגילום במקרא יותר מדאי משום דמשכא. נלע"ד משום שלימוד המקרא גם האפיקורסים לומדים בשביל הלשון כמו שלומדים שאר לשונות ואם לא תשגיח על בנך בילדותו רק על לימוד המקרא יכול להיות שתקח לו מלמד אחר משלהם כי גם הם יודעים ללמדו ומתוך כך בנך נמשך אחריהם גם בדיעות נפסדים. ובפרט בזמנינו שנתפשט התרגום אשכנזי וזה מושך לקרות בספרי הגוים כדי להיות בקי בלשונם ולכן הזהיר מזה אבל חנוך לנער על פי דרכי התורה והושיבום בין ברכי ת"ח גם בילדותם בלמדם מקרא קח לו מלמד תלמיד חכם וירגילו תכף גם במשנה וגמרא. והרבה יש להוכיח ע"ז בדורינו שפשטה המספחת מאד ומן השמים ירחמו. הרה"ג ר' יחזקאל לנדא, צל"ח, ברכות כה:

Rashi explains the phrase, (Berachos 28b) Keep your children away from *higayon*, as follows: *Don't accustom them excessively to the study of Scripture because it has the power to draw them [away].* In my humble opinion, it seems that this is because Scripture is also the subject of study by heretics who study it for its language just as they would study other languages, and if you only concentrate on your child's education in the field of Scripture, you may well take for him a teacher who is from their circles, for they also know how to teach Scripture, which will lead him to be drawn towards their perverted beliefs. **This is most certainly the case in our own generation in which the German translation [of Scripture by Mendelssohn] has been widely distributed and has drawn [them] to read the works of Gentiles [in German] in order to enable them to gain expertise in their language.** This is why [R. Eliezer b. Hyrcanus] admonished [his disciples]. Rather one should train his child in the ways of Torah and place them between the knees of Torah scholars. Even while they are young, while they are studying Scripture, take for them a teacher who is a *talmid chacham* [Torah scholar,] who will immediately accustom him as well to the study of Mishna and Talmud. This is something that needs to be desperately addressed in our generation, for this has become very widespread. May Heaven have mercy upon us. **HaRav HaGaon R. Yechezkel Landau, Chief Rabbi of Prague, Tzion L'Nefesh Chayah, Berachos 28b**

### III. The Haskalah and its Agenda

#### A.

תורת האדם קודמת בזמן לחוקי הא-לוהים העליונים . . . תורת האדם תכין את הנפש שתשתלם באחרית גם בלימודים העליונים . . . חוקי הא-לוהים ותורותיו נעלים מאוד מתורת האדם . . . ובמקום שתכלה תורת האדם תתחיל התורה הא-לוהית ותגד לנו דברים שאין בכוח שום אדם להשיגם. נפתלי הירץ וויזל, דברי שלו' ואמת עמ' 5, 9, 26

The Toras HaAdam (the study of the "Torah" common for all humanity i.e. general studies) takes precedence in time to the [study of] the higher Divine statutes . . . The [study of] Toras HaAdam will prepare the person to eventually excel in the higher [Torah] studies . . . The Divine statutes and His Torah are much loftier than the Toras HaAdam. . . . Where the Toras HaAdam ends does the Divine Torah begin. It informs us of matters which are not within the grasp of any human. **Naftali Tzvi (Hartwig) Wessely, Divrei Shalom V'Emess pp. 5, 9, 62**

#### B.

ואם ישפטו שאינו הגון ללמוד המשנה והתלמוד, . . . ילמד אחת מן האומניות שלבו נוטה אליה ויוסיף בלימוד התורה ודברי מוסר . . . ועל הדרך זה יצליחו כולם, איש איש כפי כוחו וכפי מלאכתו . . . מצליחים גם בתלמוד . . . המה יהיו לגדולים בארץ . . . וברוחב לבם יבינו שמועות התלמוד על בורין . . . כי לא נוצרנו כולנו להיות בעלי תלמוד . . . נפתלי הירץ וויזל, דברי שלו' ואמת 33-53

If the [school administration] judges the pupil to be unfit for the study of Mishna or Talmud . . . then he will go on to study one of the professions or trades that he finds satisfying. He should increase his time, [instead,] in the study of Scripture and Mussar (religious ethics). . . . Through this manner, everyone will be successful, each person according to his ability and [future] profession. . . . Those who are also successful in the study of Talmud . . . will become the great Torah scholars of the land. . . . through their broad understanding, they will gain a clear understanding of the various subjects of the Talmud. . . . [After all,] not everyone is designed to become a Talmudic scholar. . . . **Naftali Tzvi (Hartwig) Wessely, Divrei Shalom V'Emess pp. 33-35**

#### C.

האפיקורס ימ"ש וזכרו . . . איש רע . . . ההדיוט הזה . . . הבליעל . . . והצורר הזה . . . ומעולם לא קם צורר כזה בין היהודים שיסיר מסוה הבושה מעל פניו ויכתוב ויחתום ויעיד על עצמו שאין לו חלק בא-להים ולא בתורתו . . . ופרסמתי שם הרשע הזה לגנאי וכי הוא מאורר ומקולל ומוכרת מעדת ישראל . . . והמרחקו והמתעבו יתברך מן השמים. מכתב מהרה"ג ר' יחזקאל לנדא לרב פלוני מקהילת וינא, ס' הגאון ע' 216 בגליון

This heretic (Wessely), may his name and memory be blotted, . . . an evil, . . . unscrupulous person . . . and an enemy [of the Jewish people]. . . . Never has an enemy like that arisen from amongst the Jewish people [who has been so brazen as to] remove any pretense of shame from his face and to write, sign, and testify against himself that he has no part in G-d or his Torah. . . . I have publicly degraded him by name and [stated that he is] cursed, damned, and utterly cut off from the community of Israel. . . . Anyone who banishes him and treats him like an abomination will be blessed by Heaven. **Letter from HaRav HaGaon R. Yechezkel Landau, Chief Rabbi of Prague to a Rav of the community of Vienna**

D.

רע המעשה אשר ראיתי מאיש חנף ומרע איש עני בדעת הדיוט שבהדיוטים שמו הירץ וויזל מק"ק ברלין חק בדפוס אגרת . . . בדברי חלקלקות בא בעלה (בעצה) נמהרה לאנשים חכמים ונבונים תמימים ושלמים כאילו הוא יחיד בדורו. . . מה מאד מתנחם אנכי בשמענו מפי מגידי אמת שבק"ק ווילנא עיר הגדולה לאלקים שרפו ספר הלזה ברחוב העיר ובתחילה תלו אותו ברביד הברזל בחצר בית הכנסת (הקונע). . . דרשה לשבת הגדול מהרה"ג ר' דוד טעבלי אב"ד ליסא, ס' הגאון ע' 316 בגליון

I see the evil perpetrated by that flatterer and evil one, impoverished of mind, the greatest of ignoramuses, whose name is Hertz Wessely from the holy community of Berlin, who published a pamphlet [filled with] slick and polished statements offering advice to the wise and discerning, to the unblemished and perfect, as if he were the most outstanding [sage] of his generation. . . . I felt very consoled upon hearing from reliable sources that in the holy city of Vilna, the great city unto G-d, they burned this work in the town square, after having it first hung by the iron neck chain (which is used to humiliate criminals) in the courtyard of the synagogue. . . . **HaRav HaGaon R. David Tevli, Chief Rabbi of Lissa, from the D'rasha (sermon) delivered on Shabbos HaGadol, 1782**

E.

ושמעתי שבכמה ק"ק שרפו הספרים ההמה ובווילנא שרפו אותם לעין כל. זכאי חולקהון קמא מרי מלכא קדישא אשר קנאו קנאות ד' צבא-ות. דרשה מהרה"ג ר' פנחס הורביץ אב"ד פראנקפורט בעל ס' הפלאה, ס' הגאון ע' 416 בגליון

I have heard that many holy communities have burned these works; in Vilna, they burned them in public view. Meritorious before the Master, the holy King, is the portion of those who are jealous on behalf of the L-rd of hosts. **Drasha (sermon) of R. Pinchas Hurvitz, Chief Rabbi of Frankfurt am Main**

F. The Talmud is no longer studied, we have no yeshivos, our rabbis are - thank G-d - powerless, and in ten years no one in Berlin will know anything at all about the Talmud. **Letter from David Friedland written on March 30, 1788 (cited by Eliav and Kleinberger, Mekorot le'Toledot ha Chinukh be'Yisrael u-ve'Amim - Tel Aviv 1959 p. 223)**

G. A number of young Jews from all parts of Germany had united, during Mendelssohn's lifetime, to form a society under the designation, *Society for Research into the Hebrew Language*. **They correctly observed that the evil condition of our people, morally as well as politically, has its source in their religious prejudices, in their want of a rational exposition of the Holy Scriptures, and in the arbitrary exposition to which the rabbis are led by their ignorance of the Hebrew language.** Accordingly, the object of their society was to remove these deficiencies, to study the Hebrew language at its sources, and by that means to introduce a rational exegesis. For this purpose they resolved to publish a monthly periodical in Hebrew under the title of *HaMeassef* ("The Collector"), which was to present expositions of difficult passages in Scripture, Hebrew poems, prose, essays, translations from useful works, and the like. [The periodical appeared from 1783 until 1797, first in Koenigsberg, then in Berlin, and finally in Breslau.] **Solomon Maimon, Autobiography Chap. 23**

## IV. Serving G-d

A.

כִּי־לִי בְנֵי־יִשְׂרָאֵל עֲבָדִים עֲבָדֵי הֵם אֲשֶׁר־הוֹצֵאתִי אוֹתָם מֵאֶרֶץ מִצְרַיִם אֲנִי ד' אֶל־לִהְיוֹכֶם: וַיִּקְרָא כה:נה

For to Me the children of Israel are servants (*avadim*), My servants who I took out of the land of Egypt. I am the L-rd their G-d. **Leviticus 25:55**

B.

רֵאשִׁית חֲכָמָה | יִרְאַת ד' שְׁכֹל טוֹב לְכָל־עֹשֵׂיהֶם תְּהִלָּתוֹ עֲמֹדַת לְעַד: תהלים קי"א: י

The fear of the L-rd is the beginning of wisdom; a good understanding have all those who do His commandments; His praise endures for ever. **Psalms 111:10**

C.

יִרְאַת ד' רֵאשִׁית דַּעַת חֲכָמָה וּמוֹסֵר אֲוִילִים בְּזוֹ: משלי א:ז

The fear of the L-rd is the beginning of knowledge; but fools despise wisdom and instruction. **Proverbs 1:7**

D.

אֵין ישיבת האדם ותנועתו ועסקיו והוא לבדו בביתו, כישיבתו ותנועתו ועסקיו והוא לפני מלך גדול, ולא דבורו והרחבת פיו כרצונו והוא עם אנשי ביתו וקרוביו, כדבורו במושב המלך, ומפני זה מי שיבחר בשלמות האנושי ושיהיה איש הא-להים באמת, יעור משינתו וידע שהמלך הגדול המחופף עליו והדבק עמו תמיד הוא גדול מכל מלך בשר ודם. ספר מורה הנבוכים חלק ג פרק נב

The way a person acts when at home while sitting, moving, or involved in his affairs is different from the way he sits, moves or is involved in his affairs while sitting in the presence of a great king. Nor is his speech or the way he expresses himself at home the same as when he is in the presence of the king. Consequently, he who chooses to reach human perfection and to truly become a man of G-d, should awake from his slumber and realize that the great King who is hovering over him and is constantly connected to him, is greater than any king of flesh and blood. **Rambam, Moreh Nevuchim, 3:52**

## V. Acculturation and Conversion

A. I am far from reacting as favorably as you to the mood of tolerance so prevalent in all our newspapers. As long as the proponents of a unification system continue to lurk in the background, this falsely glittering, tinsel tolerance seems to me more dangerous than open persecution. Unless I am mistaken, the devious notion that kindness and tolerance rather than harshness and persecution constitute the best means to achieve conversion has already been mentioned in Montesquieu's "Lettres Persanes". And it is my impression that our time is dominated by this principle rather than by wisdom and brotherly love. . . . **Moses Mendelssohn, Letter to Herz Homberg March 1, 1784, Gesammelte Schriften Volume III p. 361**

B.

היהדות התקיימה שנות אלפים בלי ספר "פידון" בהוכחת מציאות הנפש והשארתה אחרי מות האדם בעוד כי ימי דור אחד של ההשכלה הספיקו לערער את חומות היהדות. נפתלי הירץ וויזל, מובא ב"משה מנדלסון" מצמח צמריון עמ' 111

Judaism survived for thousands of years without having to come on to [Mendelssohn's] work, Phaedon, to prove the existence of the soul and its survival after death, while just one generation of "Haskalah" (Enlightenment) was enough to undermine the bulwark of Judaism. **Naftali Tzvi (Hartwig) Wessely**

C.

(1) הַצִּילֵנִי נָא מִיַּד אַחִי מִיַּד עֵשָׂו כִּי יֵרָא אֶנְכִי אֹתוֹ פֶּן יָבֹא וְהִכְנִי אִם עַל בְּנֵי: בראשית לביב

Save me, I beseech you, from the hand of my brother, from the hand of Esau; for I fear him, lest he will come and strike me, and the mother with the children. **Genesis 32:12**

(2) ויש לפרש הכוונה דיעקב בהודעו דעשו בא לקראתו הבין דלא ימלט מאחד משני האופנים, או דעשו ילחם עמו וירצה להורגו, או דיתרצה עמו וישוב מאפו וישב עמו בשלוה ואחזה כשני אחים, ומשני האופנים הללו נתיירא יעקב, דגם טובתו ואהבתו של עשו רעה היתה אצל יעקב, ועל אלו שני האופנים אמר הכתוב ויירא יעקב מאד ויצר לו דאמר ויירא על ספק שמא יהרגנו וייצר לו על הספק שמא יתקרב לו. וזהו שביקש על הני שני אופנים הצילני נא מיד אחי מיד עשו שאיננו רוצה בו לא לאח ולא לעשו וביקש שיצילו משני ידים הללו. ונתקבלה תפלתו, דבתחילה היה בדעת עשו להרגו והקב"ה הצילו מידו, ואח"כ כשנתרצה לו ביקש להיות עמו ביחד ואמר נסעה ונלכה ואלכה לנגדך ויהיו שניהם ביחד, והוא דחה אותו בדברים וניצל גם כן בזה ממנו וכמו שאמר הכתוב וישב עשו ביום ההוא לדרכו שעירה, השמיענו הכתוב דבאותו יום עצמו נפרד עשו ממנו והלך לדרכו ולא נתעכב אפילו יום אחד עמו וכבשתו. וכבר ראיתי במפרשים שנתקשו על דברי הכתוב וישב עשו ביום ההוא לדרכו דמאי אשמועינן הפסוק דבאותו יום שב לדרכו ולפי הנ"ל מבואר היטב: והנה כל מעשי אבות הם סימן לבנים, דגם בגלותו של עשו יתנהג כן עם ישראל בשני האופנים כאשר רצה לעשות עם יעקב, דבהתחלת הגלות יהיה גזור גזירות רעות בשמדות ויסורים וילחם בהם וירצה לאבדם וד' ברחמיו לא יעזבם. ולבסוף יאמר כי רוצה לישב בשלוה עם יעקב וכוונתו דבזה ירחיק את ישראל מעבודת ד' וידיחם מאמונתם. וכמו דעשו אמר נסעה ונלכה ואלכה לנגדך ואיתא במדרש (ב"ר עח יד) דעשו אמר לו שישתתף עמו בשני העולמות עוה"ב ועוה"ז. וביאור הדברים שאמר לו נסעה ונלכה ואלכה לנגדך דהיינו ששניהם יתקברו זה אצל זה וכל אחד יוותר קצת ממנהגו הקדום עד שיתקברו זה אצל זה. והכוונה של המדרש מבואר דהוא שלבסוף גם הם יקבלו עיקרים טובים מאמונת ישראל שיהיו גם הם מאמינים בבורא יחיד ובתורה מן השמים וגמול ועונש וירצו דגם יעקב יוותר קצת מאת אשר לו ויניח קצת מעבודות הנוגע רק לעוה"ב רק יקח לו קצת מדרכי העולם וחלק בעוה"ז להתעסק בדרכים ודברים חיצונים ולא שישקדו רק על התורה. וז"ל תנא דבי אליהו זוטא פרק י"ד טול אתה העוה"ז והעוה"ב חצי ואני אטול עוה"ז ועוה"ב חצי. והכוונה שלא תהיה אתה עוסק רק בתורה ומצוה רק תמעיט עבודתך ותניח ירך מאיזו מהמצות הגורמים פירוד בין שנינו ועי"ז תנחל עוה"ז וגם חצי עוה"ב כאומר די לך רק חצי עוה"ב ולא כולו, וזהו ממש כמאמר הלצים אנכי מסתפק בחתיכה קטנה של לויתן ולא אטריח להשיג חתיכה גדולה. וגם אני אתנהג כן ואקבל קצת מן המצות ויהי גם לי חצי עוה"ב. ועל עוה"ז לא אמר חצי דידע דאם יחסר גם אחת מן המצות כבר ישיג כל העוה"ז, וזהו נסעה ונלכה ואלכה לנגדך פירוש כמוך והדברים נוקבים ויורדים כו'. וזה הגלות השני שיהיה בסוף הגליות הוא נקרא בפרך בפה רך. ומזה הגלות נתיירא יעקב אבינו יותר מיראתו מן הראשון, כי טבע האדם עלול להכשל בו יותר מן הראשון וע"כ הקדימו בתפלתו ואמר הצילני נא מיד אחי ואח"כ אמר מיד עשו, יען כי בראשון אין בו רק שיעבוד גופני והשני הוא שיעבוד בשניהם ברוחני וגם בגופני, דהרי כל הטוב שיתן הוא רק להמוותר מהמצות ונמצא מאבד נפשו, ומי שלא יחפש בהטובה היא ולא ירצה להתקרב ישאר במצב דוחקו כאשר מקודם ונמצא משתעבדים בשניהם. וזה הענין יהיה נמשך עד ביאת משיח בב"א: ספר בית הלוי על התורה פרשת וישלח

We can understand Yaakov's reaction when he heard that Esav was coming towards him as follows: He understood that either one of the following scenarios was bound to occur: Either Esav was about to do battle with him, wishing to kill him, or he was ready to be reconciled with him, forget his anger and live together with him in peace and harmony as good brothers. Yaakov, however, was frightened by both scenarios for even the goodness and love of Esav would be bad for Yaakov. Regarding these two scenarios does Scripture recount (Genesis 32:8), "Then Jacob was greatly afraid and distressed . . ." He was fearful that Esav might kill him and he was distressed as he was concerned that Esav might become close to him. He expressed these two concerns with his prayer (Genesis 32:12), "Save me, I beseech you, from the hand of **my brother**, from the hand of **Esau** . . ." He didn't want him either as a "brother" nor as an "Esav" and he pleaded that He save him from both these dangers. His prayer was accepted and although Esav originally planned to kill [Yaakov] the Holy One, blessed be He, saved him. Afterwards when [Yaakov] had appeased him, [Esav] wanted to remain together with him and said to him (Genesis 33:12), "Let us take our journey, and let us go, and I will go parallel (before) to you," so that they would both be together. Yaakov, [however,] was able to [politely] reject his offer and was thus also saved from him, as Scripture says (Genesis 33:16), "So Esau returned that day on his way to Seir." Scripture is telling us that Esav separated himself from him that very day and went on his way and didn't stay with Yaakov even for a day, as Yaakov had requested [from G-d]. I have already seen the writings of certain commentators who are bothered with the verse, "So Esau returned that day on his way to Seir." [They ask,] "To what end is this verse informing us that Esav returned on his way that very same day?" According to the above explanation everything becomes quite clear.

Behold, all of the acts of the forefathers are a sign [of future events] for their progeny, i.e. also in the present exile of Esav (the Romans and their successors) they will act with us in the very same ways as Esav wanted to act with Yaakov: In the early stages of the exile they would impose terrible decrees to destroy or torture [the Jewish people], they would wage war against them and wished to obliterate them. G-d in his mercy did not forsake them. Later on they desired to live peacefully with [the descendants of] Yaakov. Their ultimate goal was to distance the people of Israel from Divine service and thereby push them away from their [ancestral] faith. This is similar to Esav's statement, "Let us take our journey, and let us go, and I will travel parallel (before) to you," which the Midrash (Beraishis Rabbah 78:14) interprets to mean that Esav asked of Yaakov that they jointly share both worlds i.e. this world and the world to come. The explanation of these words is that when he said, "Let us take our journey, and let us go, and I will travel parallel (before) to you," he meant that they should draw closer to each other and each one should give up a little of their previous habits in order to merge together. The idea which the Midrash wishes to express is clear i.e. eventually [Esav] will accept sound principles of the faith of Israel so that they too will believe in a single Creator, in a Divine Torah, and reward and punishment. They desired, as well, that Yaakov give up some of their Divine service, that which only relates to the world to come and retain only that which relates to this world i.e. to be involved in outward superficial ceremonies and not be solely dedicated to the study and understanding of the Torah. This is the way in which the Midrash Tana d'vai Eliyahu Zuta, Chapter 14, expresses this [same] idea, "You take half of this world and the next world and I will take half of this world and the next world." What he meant to say was, "Don't be solely involved in Torah and mitzvos but rather reduce your Divine service and cease practicing those mitzvos that cause a separation between us. Through this you will inherit this world and half of the next world, i.e. it is sufficient that you receive half of the next world but not all of it." This is similar to the statement of the scoffers, "It is sufficient for me to receive a small piece of the Leviathan. I don't have to exert myself to earn a large piece." "And I too," said Esav, "will act in a similar

way. I will accept some of the mitzvos and I too will receive half of the world to come.” In regards to this world he didn’t say, “half,” for he knew that if he compromises even on one of the mitzvos that he will [automatically] obtain all of this world. This is the meaning of, “Let us take our journey, and let us go, and I will travel parallel (before) to you,” i.e. just like you. These words bore down and penetrate deeply. This is the second phase of the exile which occurs at the end of the exile. This is referred to as “perach” “peh” “rach” i.e. a glib mouth. It was from this [form of] exile that our forefather Yaakov so feared, even more than his fear of the first form, for the nature of man is that he is more likely to stumble through this [pressure] than through the former [pressure]. It was for that reason that Yaakov placed this concern first in his prayer and said, “Save me, I beseech you, from the hand of my brother,” and only afterwards said, “from the hand of Esau.” The first phase of the exile only entails a physical servitude whereas the second phase entails a dual servitude, spiritual and physical, for all the benefits that [Esav] is willing to give are only directed to those who will compromise on the fulfillment of mitzvos, thus destroying Yaakov’s soul. Whereas those who don’t wish to partake in these benefits and don’t wish to bring themselves closer [to Esav] will remain in their same distressful situation as they were before. This phase, therefore, results in a dual form of servitude, [i.e.] spiritual [for those who are willing to compromise] and physical [for those who don’t]. This will remain the situation until the coming of the Moshiach, may he come speedily in our days. **Bais HaLevi, Parshas VaYishlach**

## VI. Jewish Nationality and the Diaspora

### A.

(1) בָּרוּךְ אַתָּה ד' אֱ-לֹהֵינוּ מֶלֶךְ הָעוֹלָם. הַמְבַדֵּיל בֵּין קֹדֶשׁ לְחֵל. בֵּין אֹר לְחֹשֶׁךְ. בֵּין יִשְׂרָאֵל לְעַמִּים . . . בְּרַכַּת “הַבְּדֵלָה”

Blessed are You Hashem, king of the universe, who has separated between the holy and the mundane, between light and darkness, between Israel and the nations. **Havdalah Service**

(2) וַאֲבָדֶל אֶתְכֶם מִן הָעַמִּים לְהִיּוֹת לִי. אִם אַתֶּם מוֹבְדִלִים מֵהֶם הֲרִי אֶתֶם שְׁלִי, וְאִם לֹא, אֶתֶם שֶׁל נְבוּכַדְנֶצַּר וְחִבְרִיו. רַש"י שֵׁם

**Who has separated you from other people (Leviticus 20:26):** If you remain separate [from the other nations] then you will be Mine (i.e. protected). Otherwise, you will be under the domain of Nebuchadnezzar and his associates. **Rashi ibid.**

### C.

אומתנו איננה אומה כי אם בתורותיה, וכיון שאמר הבורא שהאומה תעמוד כל עמידת השמים והארץ, מן ההכרח שתעמד תורותיה כל ימי השמים והארץ. ספר האמונות והדעות מאמר ג

Our nation is only considered to be a nation by virtue of its Torah. Since the Creator stated that the nation will exist as long as heaven and earth exist, it follows, consequently, that its Torah will also exist as long as heaven and earth exist. **Rabbainu Saadya Gaon, HaEmunos V'HaDeyos 3**

### D.

והנה אנחנו כשבאים ממלחמת החורבן, ומרוב חסדי ד' וצדקה פזורינו נתן אותנו לחץ ולחסד בעיני מלכי האומות והשרים אשר אנו מחויבים לדרוש שלומם ולהתפלל עליהם מבלי לשלם להם ח"ו רעה תחת טובה טובה גדולה אשר גמלוננו זה אלפים שנה ואין ספק כי שכרם רב מאת ד' כי הוא ב"ה גומל טובות למי שעושה טוב. בכל זאת אין רע אם נצפה ויחל לשוב לאחוזת אבותינו והיה מן

הטוב ההוא אשר ייטיב ד' לנו יהיה טוב גם לאו"ה . . . שכל על כל הטוב אשר גמלונו בגלותינו בהיות בארצם תחת ידם . . . הרה"ג ר' משה סופר בקונטרס "אלה דברי הברית" עמוד ט

Behold, since the war that led to the destruction [of the Temple and the land of Israel,] we are in a similar state to that of prisoners of war. Due to G-d's immense kindness and charity, He made us find grace in the eyes of the kings and nobility of the nations, for whom we are required to seek their welfare and pray on their behalf. G-d forbid that we repay their great goodness, which they have bestowed upon us these thousands of years, with objectionable behavior. There is no doubt that G-d will reward them greatly, for G-d rewards goodness with goodly reward. Nevertheless, there is nothing wrong if we look forward and hope to return to the land which our forefathers possessed. The good which G-d will grant to us will also be a source of goodness to the nations of the world, . . . a reward for all of the good which they have bestowed upon us in our exile while we were in their land under their domain. **Rav Moshe Sofer, Kuntras Eleh Divrei HaBris**

#### VII. Moses Hess and the New Jewish Nationalism: Rome and Jerusalem

A. After an estrangement of twenty years, I am back with my people. I have come to be one of them again, to participate in the celebration of the holy days, to share the memories and hopes of the nation. . . . A thought which I believed to be forever buried in my heart has been revived in me anew. It is the thought of my nationality which is inseparably connected with ancestral heritage and the memories of the Holy Land, the Eternal City, the birthplace of the belief in the divine unity of life, as well as the hope in the future brotherhood of men. **Moses Hess, Rome and Jerusalem, translated by Meyer Waxman, p. 43**

B. Twenty years ago when an absurd and false accusation against the Jews was imported into Europe from Damascus, it evoked in the hearts of the Jews a bitter feeling of agony. Then it dawned upon me for the first time, in the midst of my socialist activities, that I belong to my unfortunate, slandered, despised, and dispersed people. And already, then, though I was greatly estranged from Judaism, I wanted to express my Jewish patriotic sentiment in a cry of anguish, but it was unfortunately, immediately stifled in my heart by a greater pain which the suffering of the European Proletariat evoked in me. **Rome and Jerusalem, p. 67-68**

C. . . . I discovered a real and strong relationship between my ethnological studies and the modern national movement. . . . These studies convinced me of the inevitable ultimate disappearance of any particular race dominance and the necessary regeneration of all oppressed peoples. . . . The pain and agony which during the Damascus affair was only a transient feeling became now a dominating trait of my character and a lasting mood of my soul. No more did I seek to suppress the voice of my Jewish consciousness. **Ibid. p. 70**

D. Providence would not have prolonged your existence until today, had it not reserved for you the holiest of all missions. The hour has struck for the resettlement on the banks of the Jordan. The historical books of the royal prophets can, perhaps, be written again only by you. **The New Eastern Question by Ernest Laharanne quoted in Rome and Jerusalem p. 157**

E. You are the triumphal arch of the future historical epoch, under which the great covenant of humanity will be written and sealed in your presence as the witnesses of the past and the future. The Biblical traditions which you will revive, will also sanctify anew our Occidental society and destroy the weeds of materialism together with its roots. **Ibid. p. 159**

F. . . . for our people is destined to fulfill a role in history other than the one dreamed of for fifty years, by those who are preoccupied with reforming our religion. **Moses Hess, Collected Writings, p. 182, Letter on the Mission of Israel in the History of Mankind**

G. Fortified by its racial instinct and by its cultural and historical mission to unite all humanity in the name of the Eternal Creator, this people has conserved its nationality in the form of its religion and united both inseparably with the memories of its ancestral land. No modern people, struggling for its own fatherland can deny the right of the Jewish people to its former land without at the same time undermining the justice of its own strivings. **Rome and Jerusalem, p. 36-37**

H. The "new" Jew, who denies the existence of the Jewish nationality, is not only a deserter in the religious sense, but is also a traitor to his people, his race and even to his family. If it were true that Jewish emancipation in exile is incompatible with Jewish nationality, then it were the duty of the Jews to sacrifice the former for the sake of the latter. **Ibid. p. 62**

I. In those countries which form a dividing line between the Occident and the Orient, namely, Russia, Poland, Prussia, Austria, and Turkey, there live millions of our brethren who earnestly believe in the restoration of the Jewish kingdom and pray for it fervently in their daily services. These Jews have preserved, by their belief in Jewish nationality, the very kernel of Judaism in a more faithful manner than have our Occidental Jews. **Ibid. pp. 76-77**

J. I already foresee the organization of the Society proposed by the pious Jewish patriot (Rav Tzvi Hirsch Kalischer), and its ultimate settling of the Holy Land with Jewish colonists under the protection of the Western civilized nations. When the Jewish situation in Palestine is once for all adjusted under the protection of the law, and on the foundation of labor, there will arise in the Holy Land, as in Germany and other European countries, universities conducted by able scholars whose spirit will not conflict with but harmonize with the ancient Jewish national religion. **Ibid. p. 176**

K. No member of the Jewish race can renounce the incontestable and fundamental right of his people to its ancestral land without thereby denying his past and his ancestors. Such an act is especially unseemly at a time when political conditions in Europe will not only not obstruct the restoration of a Jewish State but will rather facilitate its realization. What European would today oppose the plan that the Jews, united through a Congress, should buy back their ancient fatherland? Who would object if the Jews flung a handful of gold to the decrepit old Turkey and said to her, "Give me back my home and use the money to consolidate the other parts of your tottering Empire." . . . You will come to the land of your fathers decorated with the crown of age-long martyrdom, and there, finally, you will be completely healed from all your ills! Your capital will again bring the wide stretches of barren land under cultivation; your labor and industry will once more turn the ancient soil into fruitful valleys, reclaiming it from the encroaching sands of the desert, and the world will again pay its homage to the oldest of peoples. **The New Eastern Question by Ernest Laharanne quoted in Rome and Jerusalem pp. 153, 158**

L. The precondition for our return to the land of our fathers is to achieve national unity across our diasporas . . . The first diaspora to take that step was the British with the establishment of the Board of Deputies in London, headed by the great and pious *sar* [prince], Moses Montefiore. This institution stands by oppressed Jews wherever they are. Following it, the French Kol Israel Haverim [Alliance Israelite] was founded . . . No doubt similar associations

will be founded in other countries, together providing the pillar upon which the house of Israel will rest its hopes . . . . Another necessary step is to establish a foothold in the land of our fathers: buy land, build houses, and work the land. We rejoiced at the news of our brothers in Jerusalem buying land to build houses. Three years ago, Rabbi Luria founded the Hevrat Yishuv Eretz Yisrael with similar goals, and its membership is growing. Yet many obstacles stand in the way of establishing agricultural settlements for our brothers in the Holy Land. Who can guarantee their safety from attacks by their savage neighbors, who live off looting? It is critical for the success of this association's mission that it be headed by those of our brothers who can stand before kings and rulers, people like the Rothschilds, Montefiore, Albert Cohn, and the other leaders of the Board of Deputies and the Alliance Israelite. They are the ones who can convince European rulers to ask Turkey to safeguard the dwelling of Jews on the land of Israel . . . . To those who say, "The time has not come yet to rebuild the House of the L-rd," reply "Nonsense! The time is very right provided we take actions. What do we ask of you? To leave your country and all your possessions? No! Just that you support those who wish to go to Israel and rebuild on the remains that bear out our honor of the ancient times, as our brothers do now on Mount Zion . . . . Hurry to support [financially] the works of the Hevrat Yishuv Eretz Yisrael . . . . And you, great leaders of Israel who have the ear of kings and rulers, stand up to lead the people toward achieving this goal; only with your help can we win back the Land of our fathers. **David Gordon, editor of HaMagid, May 6, 1863**

#### VIII. Racism and Antisemitism in the Writings of Moses Hess

A. It seems that on account of the hatred that surrounds him on all sides, the German Jew is determined to cast off all signs of his Jewishness and to deny his race. No reform of the Jewish religion, however extreme, is radical enough for the educated German Jews. But even conversion does not relieve the Jew from the enormous pressure of German anti-Semitism. The German hates the Jewish religion less than the race; he objects less to the Jews' peculiar beliefs than to their peculiar noses. . . . Jewish noses cannot be reformed, and the black, wavy hair of the Jews will not change through conversion into blond, nor can its curves be straightened out by constant combing. The Jewish race is one of the primary races of mankind that has retained its integrity, in spite of the continual change of its climatic environment, and the Jewish type has conserved its purity through the centuries. **Ibid. pp. 58-59**

B. In reality, Judaism as a nationality has a natural basis which cannot be set aside by mere conversion to another faith, as is the case with other religions. A Jew belongs to his race and consequently also to Judaism, in spite of the fact that he or his ancestors have become apostates...The converted Jew remains a Jew no matter how much he objects to it. **Ibid. pp. 97-98**

C. In the organism of humanity there are no two peoples who attract and repel each other more than the Germans and the Jews. **Ibid. pp. 124-125**

D. To our educated German Jews, the feeling of hatred toward the Jews displayed by the Germans has always remained an unsolved puzzle. Was not the entire effort of the German Jews, since the days of Mendelssohn, directed toward becoming wholly Germanized, to thinking and feeling as Germans? . . . Were they not Teutonomanics and French devourers? **Ibid. pp. 71-72**

## IX. Dr. Leon Pinsker and Auto Emancipation

A. That hoary problem, subsumed under the Jewish question, today, as ever in the past, provokes discussion. Like the squaring of the circle it remains unsolved, but unlike it, continues to be the ever-burning question of the day. That is because the problem is not one of mere theoretical interest, it renews and revives in every-day life and presses ever more urgently for solution. This is the kernel of the problem, as we see it: the Jews comprise a distinctive element among the nations under which they dwell, and as such can neither assimilate nor be readily digested by any nation. Hence the solution lies in finding a means of so readjusting this exclusive element to the family of nations, that the basis of the Jewish question will be permanently removed. This does not mean, of course, that we must think of waiting for the age of universal harmony. No previous civilization has been able to achieve it, nor can we see even in the remote distance, that day of the Messiah, when national barriers will no longer exist and all mankind will live in brotherhood and concord. Until then, the nations must narrow their aspirations to achieve a tolerable *modus vivendi*. **Leon Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**

B. The world has yet long to wait for eternal peace. Meanwhile nations live side by side in a state of relative peace, secured by treaties and international law, but based chiefly on the fundamental equality between them. But it is different with the people of Israel. There is no such equality in the nations' dealings with the Jews. The basis is absent upon which treaties and international law may be applied: mutual respect. Only when this basis is established, when the equality of Jews with other nations becomes a fact, can the Jewish problem be considered solved. An equality of this kind did exist in the now long forgotten past, but unfortunately, under present conditions, the prospect that will readmit the Jewish people to the status of nationhood is so remote as to seem illusory. It lacks most of the essential attributes by which a nation is recognized. It lacks that autochthonous life which is inconceivable without a common language and customs and without cohesion in space. The Jewish people has no fatherland of its own, though many motherlands; no center of focus or gravity, no government of its own, no official representation. They home everywhere, but are nowhere at home. The nations have never to deal with a Jewish nation but always with mere Jews. The Jews are not a nation because they lack a certain distinctive national character, inherent in all other nations, which is formed by common residence in a single state. It was clearly impossible for this national character to be developed in the Diaspora; the Jews seem rather to have lost all remembrance of their former home. Thanks to their ready adaptability, they have all the more easily acquired characteristics, not inborn, of the people among whom fate has thrown them. Often to please their protectors, they divested their traditional individuality entirely. They acquired or persuaded themselves into certain cosmopolitan tendencies which could no more appeal to others than bring satisfaction to themselves. **Leon Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**

C. In the seemingly irrelevant circumstances, that the Jews are not regarded as an independent nation by other nations, rests in part the secret of their abnormal position and of their endless misery. Merely to belong to this people is to be indelibly stigmatized, a mark repellent to non-Jews and painful to the Jews themselves. However, this phenomenon is rooted deeply in human nature. Among the living nations of the earth the Jews are as a nation long since dead. With the loss of their country, the Jewish people lost their independence, and fell into a decay which is not compatible with existence as a whole vital organism. The state was crushed before the eyes of the nations. But after the Jewish people had ceased to exist as an actual state, as a political entity, they could nevertheless not submit to total annihilation -- they lived on spiritually as a nation. The world saw in this people the uncanny form of one of the dead walking

among the living. The Ghostlike apparition of a living corpse, of a people without unity or organization, without land or other bonds of unity, no longer alive, and yet walking among the living -- this spectral form without precedence in history, unlike anything that preceded or followed it, could but strangely affect the imagination of the nations. And if the fear of ghosts is something inborn, and has a certain justification in the psychic life of mankind, why be surprised at the effect produced by this dead but still living nation. A fear of the Jewish ghost has passed down the generations and the centuries. First a breeder of prejudice, later in conjunction with other forces we are about to discuss, it culminated in Judeophobia. **Leon Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**

D. Judeophobia, together with other symbols, superstitions and idiosyncrasies, has acquired legitimacy as a phobia among all the peoples of the earth with whom the Jews had intercourse. Judeophobia is a variety of demonopathy with the distinction that it is not peculiar to particular races but is common to the whole of mankind, and that this ghost is not disembodied like other ghosts but partakes of flesh and blood, must endure pain inflicted by the fearful mob who imagines itself endangered. Judeophobia is a psychic aberration. As a psychic aberration it is hereditary, and as a disease transmitted for two thousand years it is incurable. It is this fear of ghosts, the mother of Judeophobia, that has evoked this abstract, I might say Platonic hatred, thanks to which the whole Jewish nation is wont to be held responsible for the real or supposed misdeeds of its individual members, and to be libeled in so many ways, to be buffeted about so shamefully. Friend and foe alike have tried to explain or to justify this hatred of the Jews by bringing all sorts of charges against them. They are said to have crucified Jesus, to have drunk the blood of Christians, to have poisoned wells, to have taken usury, to have exploited the peasant, and so on. These and a thousand and one other charges against an entire people have been proven groundless. They showed their own weakness in that they had to be trumped up wholesale in order to quiet the evil conscience of the Jew-baiters, to justify the condemnation of an entire nation, to demonstrate the necessity of burning the Jew, or rather the Jewish ghost, at the stake. He who tries to prove too much proves nothing at all. Though the Jews may justly be charged with many shortcomings, those shortcomings are, at all events, not such great vices, not such capital crimes, as to justify the condemnation of the entire people. In individual cases, indeed, these accusations are contradicted by the fact that the Jews get along fairly well with their Gentile neighbors. This is the reason that the charges preferred are usually of the most general character, made up out of whole cloth, based to a certain extent on a priori reasoning, and true at best in individual cases, but not admitting of proof as regards the whole people. **Leon Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**

E. When an idle spectator on the road calls out to us: "You poor Jewish devils are certainly to be pitied," we are most deeply touched; and when a Jew is said to be an honor to his people, we are foolish enough to be proud of it. We have sunk so low that we become almost jubilant when, as in the West, a small fraction of our people is put on equal footing with non-Jews. But he who must be put on a footing stands but weakly. If no notice is taken of our descent and we are treated like others born in the country, we express our gratitude by actually turning renegades. For the sake of the comfortable position we are granted, for the flesh-pots which we may enjoy in peace, we persuade ourselves, and others, that we are no longer Jews, but full-blooded citizens. Idle delusion! Though you prove yourselves patriots a thousand times, you will still be reminded at every opportunity of your Semitic descent. This fateful memento mori will not prevent you, however, from accepting the extended hospitality, until some fine morning you find yourself crossing the border and you are reminded by the mob that you are, after all, nothing but vagrants and parasites, without the protection of law. **Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**

F. If we would have a secure home, give up our endless life of wandering and rise to the dignity of a nation in our own eyes and in the eyes of the world, we must, above all, not dream of restoring ancient Judaea. We must not attach ourselves to the place where our political life was once violently interrupted and destroyed. The goal of our present endeavors must be not the "Holy Land," but a land of our own. We need nothing but a large tract of land for our poor brothers, which shall remain our property and from which no foreign power can expel us. There we shall take with us the most sacred possessions which we have saved from the ship-wreck of our former country, the G-d-idea and the Bible . It is these alone which have made our old fatherland the Holy Land, and not Jerusalem or the Jordan. Perhaps the Holy Land will again become ours. If so, all the better, but first of all , we must determine -- and this is the crucial point -- what country is accessible to us, and at the same time adapted to offer the Jews of all lands who must leave their homes a secure and undisputed refuge, capable of productivization. We do not overlook the enormous external and internal difficulties involved in this, which is to be the life-long endeavor of our people. But most difficult of all will be the attainment of the first and most necessary prerequisite, the national resolution; for we are, to our sorrow, a stiff-necked people. How readily could conservative opposition, of which our history has so much to tell, nip such a resolution in the bud! If it should, then woe to our entire future! **Leon Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**

G. Therefore, the selection of a permanent, national land, meeting all requirements, must be made with every precaution and confided to one single body, through a committee of experts selected from our directorate. Only such a supreme tribunal will be able, after thorough and comprehensive investigation, to give an opinion and decide upon which of the two continents and upon which territory in them our final choice should fall. Only then, and not before, should the directorate, together with an associated body of capitalists, as founders of a stock company later to be organized, acquire a tract of land sufficient for the settlement, in the course of time, of several million Jews. This tract might form a small territory in North America, or a sovereign Pashalik in Asiatic Turkey recognized by the Porte and the other Powers as neutral. It would certainly be an important duty of the directorate to secure the assent of the Porte, and probably of the other European cabinets to this plan. Under the supervision of the directorate, the land purchased would have to be divided by surveyors into small parcels, which could be assigned according to the local conditions to agricultural, building, or manufacturing purposes. Every parcel laid off thus (for agricultural, house and garden, town-hall, factory, etc.) would form a lot which would be transferred to the purchaser in accordance with his wishes. After a complete survey and the publication of detailed maps and a comprehensive description of the land, a part of the lots would be sold to Jews for an adequate payment at a price, exactly fixed in proportion to the original purchase price, perhaps a little above it. Part of the proceeds of the sale, together with the profits, would belong to the stock company, and part would flow into a fund to be administered by the directorate, for the maintenance of destitute immigrants. For the establishment of this fund the directorate could also open a national subscription. It is definitely to be expected that our brethren everywhere would hail with joy such an appeal for subscriptions and that the most liberal donations would be made for so sacred a purpose. Each title-deed delivered to the purchaser, with his name entered and signed by the directorate and the company, must bear the exact number of the lot upon the general map so that each purchaser would know exactly the location of the piece of ground -- field, or building lot -- which he purchases as his individual property. **Leon Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**

H. Let "Now or never" be our watchword. Woe to our descendants, woe to the memory of our Jewish contemporaries, if we let this moment pass by! The Jews are not a living nation; they are everywhere aliens; therefore they are despised. The civil and political emancipation of the

Jews is not sufficient to raise them in the estimation of the peoples. The proper, the only solution, is in the creation of a Jewish nationality, of a people living upon its own soil, the auto-emancipation of the Jews; their return to the ranks of the nations by the acquisition of a Jewish homeland. We must not persuade ourselves that humanity and enlightenment alone can cure the malady of our people. The lack of national self-respect and self-confidence of political initiative and of unity, are the enemies of our national renaissance. That we may not be compelled to wander from one exile to another, we must have an extensive, productive land of refuge, a center which is our own. The present moment is the most favorable for this plan. The international Jewish question must have a national solution. Of course, our national regeneration can only proceed slowly. We must take the first step. Our descendants must follow us at a measured and not over-precipitant speed. The national regeneration of the Jews must be initiated by a congress of Jewish notables. No sacrifice should be too great for this enterprise which will assure our people's future, everywhere endangered. The financial execution of the undertaking does not present insurmountable difficulties. Help yourselves, and G-d will help you! **Leon Pinsker, Auto Emancipation**